

Coals transportation's steep route to realization

Muhammad Septiawan¹, Illy Yanti², Sigit Hartono³

^{1,2,3}UIN Sulthan Thaha Saifuddin jambi, Jambi Indonesia.

(email:imam.arifaillah@uinjambi.ac.id)

Abstract

This research is motivated by the unrealized specific road for transporting coal mining products in Jambi Province which has been delayed for 9 years. This study uses a qualitative research approach. The data sources used in the study were selected by purposive sampling method. The results showed that the construction of a specific road for coal transportation in Jambi Province had not yet had an impact on people's lives. These impacts are economic, social and road safety impacts. The unrealized policy is caused by several factors including the budget, political pressure, the complexity of licensing, and the dynamics of land acquisition.

Keyword: Coal transportation, public policy, specific road.

INTRODUCTION

Indonesia is one of the world's largest producers and the biggest exporters of coal[1]. A significant portion of its exported thermal coal consists of the medium-quality type (between 5100 and 6100 cal/gram) and the low-quality type (below 5100 cal/gram) for which large demand originates from China and India. According to information presented by Indonesia's Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources, Indonesian coal reserves are estimated to last around 83 years if the current rate of production is to be continued.

One of the areas in Indonesia that is rich in coal is Jambi Province. Coal is an important source of revenue for the state, and Jambi province is one of the largest producers. Jambi province has 788.65 million tons of coal, according to the Ministry of Energy, spread throughout various districts: Bungo, Tebo, Tanjabbarat, Sarolangun, Merangin, Batanghari, and Muaro Jambi.

Natural resources existence in Jambi are not only a source of local revenue, but they also necessitate close attention to environmental issues, effective governance, and long-term development. To adjust productivity, including coal resources, the keywords are synergy and harmonization among all parties involved in resource usage. Besides providing financial contributions to local revenue, coal also increases transportation problems in Jambi province[2].

Aside from the financial contributions to local revenue, coal faces a number of challenges in Jambi province, particularly in terms of transportation from the mine to the stockpile. Hundreds of

coal trucks are traveling from mining locations in several districts in Jambi province's western region to the port in the province's eastern region. The use of public roads by trucks has resulted in road deterioration. The roads, which have a carrying capacity of 8 tons, are not capable of supporting coal trucks weighing ten tons or more[3].

Various problems arise as a result of the coal transportation process in Jambi Province including **First**, accidents often occur involving coal transport trucks. The accident occurred because the driver of the coal truck was exhausted from the long journey (10 hours' drive). Currently, coal transportation is allowed to cross public roads only at certain hours, starting at 18.00-06.00 WIB. **Second**, public roads are damaged. The indication of road damage is caused by thousands of coal trucks that pass every day[4][5][6]. Facts on the ground show that the damaged roads when viewed from Sarolangun Regency are mostly in the lane of coal trucks that will go to transport coal to Jambi City. In the second semester of 2019, according to data by the Jambi Province BPJN, on the Bangko City-Sarolangun Regency road section there was a 10.1 KM decline in road quality. **Third**, congestion problems caused by coal trucks. In the process of transporting coal, trucks carry out convoys. There are approximately two thousand coal trucks that pass every day. With the condition that coal trucks can only cross public roads at 18.00-06.00 WIB, it can be averaged every twenty seconds one coal truck crosses one point on the road segment. Not to mention if the truck has a traffic accident [7]. Congestion is not only felt by residents who want to pass, but also other goods transport vehicles such as transportation of palm oil and consumer goods [8]. In the last few weeks Indonesia sets coal benchmark price at highest in a decade on Chinese demand[9]. Coal mining entrepreneurs ramped up production and encouraged truck drivers to haul more coal than usual. As a result, there is more congestion in Jambi City than usual. Trucks queue for fuel along the gas station. The large size of the vehicle fills the road, hampering traffic, especially during rush hours.

In reaction, on 28th December 2012, Territorial Direction (Perda) of Jambi Territory Number 13 of 2012 was endorsed with respect to the coal transportation in Jambi Area[10]. This direction sets any coal transportation in Jambi area. The regulation required coal to be transported in particular road. The particular road must be built and prepared to utilize not afterward than January 2014. This arrangement appeared a one-year elegance period to businessmen to make their claim uncommon streets to transport the coal. The use of specific roadways for the movement of mining products and plantation industries has a beneficial effect on transportation and environmental economics, consistent with the nation's benefit, justice, and interests. [11]

The one-year due date had passed, and specific road has not been realized. Moreover, streams are troublesome to utilize since of silting. Transactions with remote speculators around digging of Batang Hari Stream was carried out since 2010 but fizzled. The results that develop afterward are coal transport action still utilize open streets.

Various problems that arise from coal transportation activities require all parties to seriously seek solutions for the construction of special roads for coal transportation. However, until now the construction of a special road for coal transportation has not yet been realized. Thus, it is important to know the dynamics that occur in the process of realizing the construction of a particular road for coal transportation in Jambi.

METHODS

In this study, the author uses a qualitative research approach. Qualitative research is useful for gaining a better understanding of the various problems that exist in every human interaction. Sources of data used in this study are in the form of information from interviews with respondents, namely Coal truck drivers, Road users other than coal truck drivers, Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD) Jambi Province, Transportation Service (Dishub) Jambi Province, Investment Service – Service. Integrated One Stop (DPM-PTSP) Jambi Province, Directorate of Traffic (Ditlantas) Jambi Regional Police, Traffic Unit (Satlantas) Muaro Jambi Police, Land Transportation Management Center (BPTD) Region V Jambi Province, and the National Road Implementation Center (BPJN) Jambi Province.

In addition, data sources are also obtained from the literature, both in the form of books and articles in journals that are considered important in supporting this research. Furthermore, the author uses an inductive model data analysis technique, namely an analysis that starts from data collection, data reduction, data presentation, as well as verification and concluding the data.

Finding and Discussion

The impact of public road for coal transportation

Public face problem every day. The government is the actor who is considered most responsible for public problems [12]. Policies have the aim of solving problems faced by society. Lassance describe the purpose of public policy as an institutionalized proposal is to solve relevant and real-world problems, guided by a conception[13]. Furthermore, the policy is implemented by programs as a course of action created and/or enacted, typically by a government[14].

Open approach can be conceptualized in changing ways, agreeing to the purposes of the speaker or creator, and the characteristics of the circumstance they are concerned with. Paul Cairney define public policy is the sum total of government action from signals of intent to the final outcomes[15], a definition that can simply be accepted by logic. This definition becomes unfair when faced with the fact that most public problems are not handled by the government. In this case it may be useful to identify a policy in terms of what actually happens[16].

Therefore, this paper departs from the definition of public policy that is uniquely proposed by Thomas R Dye. He defines public policy as something a little more different than other experts. Public policy is whatever governments choose to do or not do; it can be seen in the behavior of government officials and agencies; it defines the relationship of government to its environment[17]. Every political decision or policy taken or not taken by the government will automatically have consequences[18].

The output of the decision has an impact on people's lives, either directly or indirectly. So that this is correlated between the condition that the construction of a special road for coal transportation in Jambi Province has not yet been implemented with the impact felt by people's lives. These impacts are economic, social and road safety impacts.

1. Economic Impact

The distance between the mine site and the port is far. traffic jams and strict travel rules are a challenge for truck drivers. the wages received by truck drivers are relatively low when compared to the workload. this is recognized by truck drivers as one of the factors they transport coal beyond the capacity specified by regulations.

This challenge will increase if there is a time limit on crossing public roads for coal truck drivers. drivers often have to compete with time so that in one day the driver can unload once. If a coal truck cannot unload its cargo in one day due to the limitation of hours on public roads for coal trucks,

this condition will further hamper performance which has an impact on income and the economy, especially for coal truck drivers.

Not to mention the reduction in the income of coal truck drivers as a result of illegal levies carried out by "unscrupulous" people on certain roads. Economic problems sometimes motivate people to ignore other things. Therefore, to create a conducive atmosphere in the midst of community activities, ideally the basic material needs of the economy of individuals, families and groups must be met.

2. Social Impact

social problem is more like a process, rather than a type of condition[19]. It examines how and why people come to believe that certain conditions should be classified as social problems, or how they socially construct social problems. Typically, the social problems process begins with claim makers asserting that a given state should be classified as a problem, that it should be interpreted in particular ways, and that it requires attention.

Since there is currently no clarity on the construction of a special road for coal transportation in Jambi Province, so the construction has never been implemented. As a result, this situation has an impact on the problem of social activities of the community around the roads that are traversed by coal transportation.

Social problems are unpleasant conditions that are felt by many people and require solving these problems collectively. The impact of these social problems is in the form of public views of road users (especially two-wheelers) to coal truck drivers who tend to be negative because they feel disturbed by coal transportation activities through public roads. The interaction between coal truck drivers and road users is often strained.

Social problems such as the explanation above are increasingly worrying because they are the cause of physical conflicts (brawls between the community and coal truck drivers). The conflict occurred in a case of commotion between the community around the road and the coal truck

driver in the Kumpeh area around 2018. The trigger was because the coal truck driver passed the public road not according to the specified time.

3. Driving Safety

Accidents in coal mines pose a grave danger to miners and the surrounding environment[20]. The lack of construction of special roads for coal transportation also has an impact on driving safety on public roads. The sight of a coal hauling truck accident is something that people commonly witness. With the ongoing coal transportation activities through public roads, these activities often result in road accidents involving coal trucks.

Accidents can occur between coal trucks or between coal trucks and other drivers. Not without reason, the accident could have occurred because the coal truck driver's stamina was not good because he had traveled a very long distance, the hours on public roads were limited, the load was often excessive, and because many roads were damaged. The community believes that if there is a special road for coal transportation, then the safety and comfort on the highway will increase.

The public's anxiety is well-founded, because accidents on public roads often involve coal trucks. Until April 4, 2018, the Head of Sub-Directorate for Gakkum Ditlantas Jambi Police explained that 22 people died as a result of accidents involving coal trucks, 3 people died from January to March 2018, 7 seriously injured 8 minor injuries. Information from the Kasatlantas Polres Batanghari, throughout October 2018, in Jambi there were 20 accidents, 11 people died.

In Muaro Jambi, an accident involving a coal truck, among others, occurred on March 22, 2018, an accident occurred in the Jambi Outer City District, one elementary school student died. On April 17, 2018 there was an accident involving a coal truck in Jambi Luar Kota District, one person died. On April 29, 2018, there was an accident involving a coal truck in Jambi Luar Kota District, one young man died. On February 18, 2019, there was an accident involving a coal truck in Mendalo Village, Muaro Jambi

Regency, one person died. On February 27, 2020, there was a single coal truck accident at Mendalo, Muaro Jambi Regency.

Accidents involving coal trucks in Jambi City, among others, occurred on October 2, 2019 in the South Rim of Jambi City, one coal truck driver was injured. On October 12, 2019, there was an accident involving a coal truck in Alam Barajo, Jambi City, one person died. On May 11, 2020, a single coal truck accident occurred in Kenali Besar, Jambi City. On September 23, 2020 there was an accident involving a coal truck on the Jambi City East Ring Road, there were two victims who were quite seriously injured, namely a husband and wife and one coal truck driver who was injured.

Meanwhile, accidents involving coal trucks in Batanghari Regency, among others, occurred on August 25, 2018 in Durian Luncuk, Batanghari Regency, one MTS student died and another was injured. On October 9, 2018, there was an accident involving a coal truck in Rantau Puri Village, Batanghari Regency, one vocational student died. On November 20, 2018 there was an accident involving a coal truck in Sungai Rengas District, two victims died. On March 7, 2020 there was an accident involving a truck.

Meanwhile, accidents involving coal trucks in Sarolangun Regency, among others, occurred on June 18, 2019 in Sarolangun Regency, the accident was a single accident. On March 10, 2020 there was an accident involving a coal truck in Sarolangun Regency, two people were seriously injured.

Furthermore, accidents involving coal trucks in Merangin Regency, among others, occurred on August 21, 2020 in Merangin Regency, one private vehicle was damaged. With the information on the number of accidents involving coal trucks being quite high, the comfort and safety of driving on public roads seems to be disturbed. Therefore, there is no longer any reason for the government and companies not to build a special road for coal transportation, because this already concerns the safety of the lives of motorists on the road.

Factors inhibiting the construction of specific road for coal transportation

In this discussion, the authors will specifically describe the factors that hinder the construction of a special road for stone transportation in Jambi Province, the information the author gets from various sources. Knowing these factors is very crucial to find out the reasons why the construction of a special road for coal transportation has not yet been implemented. In fact, according to the mandate of the Jambi Province Regional Regulation No. 13 of 2012 concerning Coal Transport Arrangements in Jambi Province, Chapter 3 Article 5 Paragraph 1 explains that every coal transportation within Jambi Province must go through special roads or river roads. The author believes that the material in the regional regulation (perda) was made with a long process and has gone through various kinds of discourses and the absorption of aspirations from various parties, including the aspirations expressed by the community. The absorption of aspirations by the government, both legislative and executive institutions, is important, because respecting freedom of expression and opinion is seen as one of the keys to upholding democracy.

If it is calculated from 2014 until now, it means that the year has passed, but the construction of a special road for coal transportation has not yet been implemented. The government and the consortium of coal mining companies that were given the noble responsibility to take care of the construction of special roads have not yet been able to realize it with all kinds of obstacles. By knowing the inhibiting factors for the construction of a special coal road, it will find a bright spot for the problem that is happening. There are various inhibiting factors so that a special road for coal transportation in Jambi Province has not yet been built.

Authors grouped them into several parts according to the problem constraints which have previously been harmonized with the theory of "inhibiting factors" in the previous section in this paper. The inhibiting factors that the author means include, budget factors, political policy factors from the government, licensing factors, land acquisition factors, and coordination factors between sectors and the government.

1. Budget Factors

Budget is a very important factor in carrying out an activity, whatever it is. Especially regarding infrastructure development activities such as roads. The budget is a special concern for the implementers who will carry out the development. If not, it is feared that development will be hampered. One example is the policy of the Jambi Provincial Government in building a special road for coal transportation, the development was hampered due to budgetary constraints.

Indeed, the construction of the road is carried out by a coal mining company, but it does not limit the role of the government to continue to accommodate and cannot be separated from the development. Viewed from the other side, if the company argues that it does not have enough budget, why in practice coal mining companies are still operating until now, in fact it has been almost seven years if calculated from 2014. Of course, this encourages an in-depth study of why all of this can be done. happen. The author found discrepancies in

information between the Jambi Provincial DPRD's statement and information from the Transportation Agency and the Jambi Province DPM-PTSP Service.

If the Jambi Provincial DPRD informed that the coal company agreed to build a special road, but the Transportation Agency and the Jambi Province DPM-PTSP Office said that the coal company had not yet been able to build a special road due to cost constraints. Of course, this indicates that there is a difference in the information the company conveys to government agencies. This makes the government confused, especially for the people. What is also feared is that there is an impression that companies want to clash between government institutions. Do not let the local government that has full power to manage an area is controlled by companies that own capital.

2. 'Political' aspect of policy

In addition to the budget factor, political policy factors from the local government greatly affect the success or failure of the construction of special roads for coal transportation in Jambi Province. The political policy by the local government in giving "emphasis" to coal mining companies to build a special road for coal transportation is considered to be one option so that companies can be responsible for carrying out their responsibilities in accordance with the regulations that have been made. If the government is not firm in making decisions, then a development policy is difficult to achieve. Moreover, the construction of a special road for coal transportation involves the private sector (company). It takes the ability and a better approach strategy from the government to the company so that companies can be invited to work together in carrying out development.

However, indeed, regarding the political policies of the government, each regional head usually has a different vision and mission, and this also influences the policies taken by the regional government. If the regional head changes, the policies adopted or prioritized are also different. It is very important to harmonize every policy as a result of the change of regional head. Bearing in mind, in the case of the construction of a special road for coal transportation in Jambi Province, three different governors have passed. To note, that is the consequence of living in a country whose government system adheres to a democratic climate.

All kinds of differences in the vision and mission of the regional head which are translated into public policies must be respected. The difference in vision and mission, both between local governments and between regional governments and the central government, is a consequence of democratic governance that adheres to the decentralization principle applied in post-reform Indonesia. Decentralization is an answer to the insistence of various elements to immediately realize a decentralized system after the centralization that has been carried out for a long time by the New Order power is no longer acceptable. The government's firmness should be emphasized even more when coordinating with coal mining companies. This is all because the role of the government and companies are equally important in relation to building special roads for coal transportation.

If good cooperation has been established, the government and companies can immediately build a special road for coal transportation. Thus, coal transportation in the process of its journey no longer uses public roads. The government's strategy will also affect several factors that are considered to be hampering the construction of special roads for coal transportation, including land acquisition and licensing factors.

3. Permit Factors

Licensing is an initial administrative requirement that must be carried out so that the construction of special roads goes through clear procedures, so that unwanted problems do not occur in the future. When going to build a special road for coal transportation, the company as the executor of course must pass the licensing stage.

Regarding the construction of a special road for coal transportation, PT. Putra Bulian Properti to build a special road for coal transportation, but it is only limited to submitting a letter of approval in principle. Meanwhile, the permit letter cannot be followed up because all the requirements have not been completed.

. In contrast to PT. Putra Bulian Properti, PT. Sinar Anugerah Sukses (SAS) has received permission from the Jambi Province DPM-PTSP Office to build a special road for coal transportation. However, PT. SAS could not complete the project because there were also obstacles to land acquisition.

4. Land acquisition

As the author has explained above, this section will explain regarding the permit for the construction of a special road for coal transportation which cannot be followed up on its implementation because there are obstacles to land acquisition which have not been fully carried out. Obstacles still occur in the land acquisition process. Liberation has not been fully liberated. The special road route, which will actually cross from Sarolangun Regency, through Batanghari Regency, and through to Muaro Jambi Regency, has not yet been fully implemented. Planning a special road route through Sarolangun Regency to Muaro Jambi Regency has a length of about 125 KM. The route for the land that has been acquired is only in the Muaro Jambi Regency area. Meanwhile, land in the other two regencies has not been acquired. According to the author, the government's role is very much needed in solving the problem so that land acquisition can be completed immediately.

The government must be ready to back up the company so that the company can immediately free up land for the construction of a special road for coal transportation. The government also has an important role as a mediator or a bridge between the company that will acquire the land and the party whose land will be acquired (the community).

5. Lack of Coordination between stakeholders

The coordination function carried out by the government before taking a policy is very important because without coordination, the implementation of the policy may be hampered or even fail[21]. Therefore, it is important for government agencies to coordinate with

various parties in order to achieve the planned development. This coordination can be done between government agencies or with private parties (companies). The coordination function carried out by the government has actually been implemented. However, there still seems to be a difference in information between the Dishub and the Jambi Province DPM-PTSP Service and the Jambi Provincial DPRD regarding the budget factors that have been presented in the previous discussion. This means that there is still a gap in the government's error in coordinating, both between governments and between the government and companies.

Collaborative policy procedures are increasingly being recommended for resolving social-ecological system management issues[22]. The government should pay more attention to its function in coordinating so that small gaps are getting smaller day by day, so that a policy that has passed the planning process can be implemented.

Conclusion

From the various reviews above, the authors come to at least three conclusions. The construction of a special road for coal transportation must be carried out as soon as possible so that the community does not continue to feel the impact because a special road for coal transportation has not yet been built. These impacts include economic, social and safety impacts on public roads. The government, coal mining companies, and the community should work together to solve problems related to budget and land acquisition which are the main factors hindering the construction of special roads so that special roads for coal transportation can be built.

The efforts made by the government were not enough to pressure companies to immediately build a special road for coal transportation. An alternative strategy is needed so that the coordination between the government and the company produces results, so that the construction of a special road for coal transportation in Jambi Province can be implemented.

REFERENCES

T. Economics, "Coal | 2008-2021 Data | 2022-2023 Forecast | Price | Quote | Chart | Historical | News," Sep. 2021. <https://tradingeconomics.com/commodity/coal> (accessed Sep. 11, 2021).

A. Subhan, "Disputes on Public Roads: Coal Transportation Policy and Actor Networks in

- Jambi Province, Indonesia," *J. Soc. Dev. Sci.*, 2017, doi: 10.22610/jsds.v7i4(s).1503.
- Y. Safitri, "Truck drivers protest South Sumatra coal transport ban on public roads," Nov. 22, 2018. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2018/11/22/truck-drivers-protest-south-sumatra-coal-transport-ban-on-public-roads.html> (accessed Sep. 11, 2021).
- D. News, "Jalan Lintas Timur Riau-Jambi Rusak Parah," 2011. <https://news.detik.com/berita/d-1658216/jalan-lintas-timur-riau-jambi-rusak-parah> (accessed Sep. 11, 2021).
- J. Independen, "Warga Blokir Jalan Simpang Niam," Jul. 15, 2020. <https://www.jambi-independent.co.id/read/2021/07/15/13502/warga-blokir-jalan-simpang-niam/> (accessed Sep. 11, 2021).
- H. H. Sandi, "Warga Desa Mengueh Tebo Protes Jalan Rusak Akibat Truk Pengangkut Batubara - Tribunjambi.com," Jul. 14, 2021. <https://jambi.tribunnews.com/2021/07/14/warga-desa-mengueh-tebo-protes-jalan-rusak-akibat-truk-pengangkut-batubara> (accessed Sep. 11, 2021).
- Detail.ID, "Truk Batu Bara Kembali Mengalami Kecelakaan di Kota Jambi, Arus Lalu Lintas Macet dari Segala Arah | Bicara Apa Adanya," Sep. 04, 2021. <https://detail.id/2021/09/truk-batu-bara-kembali-mengalami-kecelakaan-di-kota-jambi-arus-lalu-lintas-macet-dari-segala-arrah/> (accessed Sep. 11, 2021).
- batangharinews, "Truk Batubara Terguling, Jalin Jambi-Bulian Macet - Batangharinews.com | Berita Batanghari Terkini," Mar. 20, 2019. <http://batangharinews.com/read/2019/03/20/631/truk-batubara-terguling-jalin-jambibulian-macet/> (accessed Sep. 11, 2021).
- Reuters, "Indonesia sets coal benchmark price at highest in a decade on Chinese demand | Reuters," Jul. 05, 2021. <https://www.reuters.com/business/energy/indonesia-sets-coal-benchmark-price-highest-decade-2021-07-05/> (accessed Sep. 11, 2021).
- A. Subhan, "JEJARING KEBIJAKAN PENGANGKUTAN BATUBARA DI PROVINSI JAMBI DITINJAU DARI PERSPEKTIF GOOD GOVERNANCE," *CosmoGov*, 2017, doi:

10.24198/cosmogov.v1i1.11801.

- D. Yuniar, A. Wicaksono, L. Djakfar, and A. Efendi, "Effects of Coal Freight Road Policy Reforms on Transportation and Environmental Economics," 2019, doi: 10.1088/1755-1315/328/1/012037.
- H. D. S. Medeiros and S. H. A. C. Forte, "Rethinking State Social Responsibility With the Creation of Shared Public Value," *Int. J. Bus. Adm.*, 2021, doi: 10.5430/ijba.v12n1p44.
- A. Lassance, "What Is a Policy and What Is a Government Program? A Simple Question With No Clear Answer, Until Now," *SSRN Electron. J.*, 2020, doi: 10.2139/ssrn.3727996.
- G. Capano and M. Howlett, *A Modern Guide to Public Policy*. 2020.
- Paul Cairney, "Understanding Public Policy: Theories and Issues," *Underst. Public Policy*, 2020.
- N. Nawarat and M. Medley, "The Public Regime for Migrant Child Education in Thailand: Alternative Depictions of Policy," *Asian Polit. Policy*, 2018, doi: 10.1111/aspp.12408.
- M. S. Whittington, "Thomas R. Dye, Understanding Public Policy. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1972, pp. xii, 305.," *Can. J. Polit. Sci.*, 1972, doi: 10.1017/s0008423900037094.
- S. B. Emery, H. A. J. Mulder, and L. J. Frewer, "Maximizing the Policy Impacts of Public Engagement: A European Study," *Sci. Technol. Hum. Values*, 2015, doi: 10.1177/0162243914550319.
- M. Veresné Somosi and K. Varga, "How Does Social Innovation Contribute to Solving Social Problems? A Process-Oriented Framework for Measuring Social Innovation," *Eur. J. Soc. Sci. Educ. Res.*, 2019, doi: 10.2478/ejser-2018-0007.
- J. Zhang, J. Fu, H. Hao, G. Fu, F. Nie, and W. Zhang, "Root causes of coal mine accidents: Characteristics of safety culture deficiencies based on accident statistics," *Process Saf. Environ. Prot.*, 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.psep.2020.01.024.

- C. Ansell, E. Sørensen, and J. Torfing, "Improving policy implementation through collaborative policymaking," *Policy Polit.*, 2017, doi: 10.1332/030557317X14972799760260.
- H. A. van Hardeveld, P. P. J. Driessen, P. P. Schot, and M. J. Wassen, "Supporting collaborative policy processes with a multi-criteria discussion of costs and benefits: The case of soil subsidence in Dutch peatlands," *Land use policy*, 2018, doi: 10.1016/j.landusepol.2018.06.002.